SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh) : Madam, I am rising in support of my good friend, Mr. Bhardwaj. I do not know why ...*(Interruptions)*...

उपसभापति : आपकी बात का जवाब मंत्री जी को देना है, मुझे नहीं देना है ।

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA : They do not allow me to speak. How can I speak? ...*(Interruptions)*... I will convey the feelings of the House to the Home Minister. You don't allow me to say even that ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री मोहम्मद अफ़जल उर्फ मोम अफ़जल : इससे ज्यादा आप ममता बैनर्जी को ज्यादा अपमानित नहीं कर सकते है जिस तरह से आप कर रहे हैं ...(व्यवधान) । आपको याद होगा, कल तक ये सी० पी० एम० से वोट की भीख मांग रहे थे और जब वोट नहीं मिला तो खड़े हो गये हैं । कल तक जब से सी० पी० एम० से वोट की भीख मांग रहे थे तो सी० पी० एम० के खिलाफ इन्होंने एक लफ़्ज तक नहीं कहा ...(व्यवधान) ।

شری محمد افضل عرف م۔ افضل : اس سے زیادہ آپ ممتا بنرجی کو زیادہ اپمانت نہیں کر سکتے ہیں جس طرح سے آپ کر رہے ہیں ۔"مداخلت"۔ آپ کو یاد ہوگا کہ کل تک یہ سی۔ پی۔ ایم۔ سے ووٹ کی بھیک مانگ رہے تھے اور جب ووٹ نہیں ملا تو کھڑے ہو گئے ہیں۔ کل تک جب سی۔ پی۔ ایم سے ووٹ کی بھیک مانگ رہے تھے تو سی۔ پی۔ ایم کے خلاف انھوں نے ایک لفظ تک نہیں کہا... "مداخلت"

RE: PERSONAL EXPLANATION BY SHRI H. R. BHARDWAJ, MINISTER OF LAW, JUSTICE AND COMPANY AFFAIRS.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That matter is over now. Please sit down. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh) : Madam, I am rising in favour of my good friend, Mr. Bhardwaj. We learnt from the press that an explanation was sought from him. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The Bhardwaj matter is over yesterday. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : I would like to know from the Government as to why an explanation was sought from him. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not allowing it. That matter was taken up yesterday. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam, he told the truth. If he told the truth why should he submit an explanation ? *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That thing is over. *(Interruptions)*... I don't know. How do we discuss it now? *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : I would like to know as to what explanation was given by him. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is between him and the Prime Minister. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : We discussed the matter yesterday in the House. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I don't know. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : You adjourned the House. The matter remained inconclusive. How do we go about that ? *(Interruptions)*... How do we go about that ? The matter remained inconclusive. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh) : Madam, I am on a point of order. Delhi is the capital of India. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : No, no. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He has taken my permission. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Delhi is the capital of India. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : No, no. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He is on a point of order. I gave my ruling. If the Prime Minister has asked for his explanation it is between the Prime Minister and his Council of Ministers. It doesn't come under the Chair. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : It does come

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

under the House. What concerns the House, what concerns the country, concerns you. *(Interruptions)*...

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT) : Madam, this is a public concern. We want to know what the result of his asking for an explanation is. *(Interruptions)*...That is what we want to know. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI E. BALANANDAN (Kerala) : We are equally concerned, not the Prime Minister alone. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : I am concerned about the fate of Mr. Bhardwaj who had the courage to tell the truth. don't want Mr. Bhardwaj to be sacrified. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI E. BALANANDAN : We want to know what happened. Don't we have a right to know it? Let him explain to us. He can give the explanation to the Prime Minister. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : This matter was raised yesterday. It was inconclusive. *(Interruptions)*...The matter could not be discussed yesterday. So, Mr. Bhardwaj is here. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI E. BALANANDAN : He had issued a statement that Ministers had taken bribe. Let him explain as to what had happened. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now that is over. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : I am on a point of order which is constitutionally important. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : How do you dispose of the matter? *(Interruptions)*...Madam, yesterday also the matter remained inconclusive. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : There is no question of disposing of anything. *(Interruptions)*...Mr. Jaipal Reddy ...*(Interruptions)*...Just a minute, please. *(Interruptions)*... No cross-talks. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : A matter cannot be raised in a vacuum here. If a matter has been raised here it needs to be responded to. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Jaipal Reddy, the matter is not written before me. In any case, you are raising it out of order. If you are raising it as a question, what the Prime Minister has asked and what the Minister has replied, it is between the Prime Minister and the Minister. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : We have discussed the matter for a long time in the House yesterday. The matter remained inconclusive. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Okay.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : How do we go about it? *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not a party to it. I don't know. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY (Andhra Pradesh) : There is a press report that the Prime Minister has ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You ask the Government, not me.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Through whom? Therefore, Madam, we can ask the Government only through you. *(Interruptions)*... We can ask only through you. *(Interruptions)*... Mrs. Margaret Alva, who is very prompt on other occasions, is sitting pretty now. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI E. BALANANDAN : Madam, now he is available here and let him explain. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal) : Yesterday Mr. Bhardwaj said that the videotape was done in the studio of Mr. Jain. He had stated that an unauthorised circulation of the videotape was done. Since Mr. Jain is a Member of the House, can I request, Madam, that he may kindly be asked to give an explanation so far as the statement of Mr. Bhardwaj is concerned? *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Order. *(Interruptions)*... Order in the House, please. *(Interruptions)*... Order. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA : Mr. Jain is here. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please. *(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. *(Interruptions)*... Mr. Jain has asked for permission of the Chairman to make a personal explanation and the Chairman has permitted him and he will make his explanation. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Madam, a small point which is not connected with this. Madam, you know Delhi is the capital of India.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What has Delhi got to do with it?

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Not with this. It is another point.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, you cannot raise a point of order like this.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: I have already got the permission from you.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I didn't give the permission. I didn't understand what you are talking about.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Madam, the police of other States cannot come to Delhi. You know that even on the two Haryana Constables' issue a Government fell. The Tamil Nadu police has kidnapped Members of Parliament. They are under detention in the Tamil Nadu House. The whole place is crawling with the Tamil Nadu police. This is wholly against the Constitution. So, action should be taken against the Tamil Nadu police.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Subramanian Swamy, there is no point of order in it. so, I cannot give any ruling. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL *alias* MEEM AFZAL (Uttar Pradesh): Madam, he has raised a point of order. But he did not make his point of order. Therefore, it should be expunged from the records. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: I have given facts. there is nothing unparliamentary. *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seats. I know what should be done. Don't worry, the proper thing would be done.

DR. JINENDRA KUMAR JAIN (Madhya Pradesh): Madam, I thank you very much.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would not allow any discussion because it is a personal explanation. According to the Rule, according to Kaul and Shakdher. no debate or question will be arising out of this personal explanation. I make it very clear. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM: I agree with you. But..*(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It was wrong. When I came into the Chair, I discovered that Mr. Bhardwaj made his explanation under Rule 142. The Parliamentary Affairs Minister has also said that. I have gone through the records. I did not allow any further clarification because under Rule 142 nobody can ask any question on personal explanation. So, I won't allow any question. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, yesterday, Rule 142 and Rule 152...*(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you don't read Kaul and Shakdher and if you don't know the rules, it is not my fault. You should read it. The Vice-Chairman also should have brought it to his notice. *(Interruptions)*. The Parliamentary Affairs Minister brought it to his notice. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN (West Bengal): It was not made clear. The Vice-Chairman asked him, "Under what rule do you want to make a statement ?" He did not reply. He simply started making a statement. *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. *(Interruptions)*. I have gone through the records. I have gone through every word of the records. Mr. Bhardwaj said it as a Member and as a Member only he can make a personal explanation. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: He might have..*(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There was no argument..*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: We demanded explanation from him in his capacity as a Minister. He might have made his statement in his capacity as a Member. But we demanded..*(Interruptions)*. We did it on behalf of the House. I could not have done it in the capacity as an individual.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You cannot infringe on the right of a Member to speak as a Member. You cannot direct a Member to make his explanation under any rule which you want. It is entirely his prerogative. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Please don't forget, he got his interview recorded in his capacity as a Minister. If he was to be a Member that interview would not have been recorded

SHRI M. A. BABY (Kerala): Madam, I am on a point of order. *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is no discussion.

SHRI M. A. BABY: It is very important. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, we will pass a confidence motion in Mr. Bhardwaj for telling the truth. *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Will you please keep quiet? *(Interruptions)*. What is your point of order?

SHRI M. A. BABY: Madam, the controversy of Shri Bhardwaj giving the reply whether as a Member of this House or as a member of the Council of Ministers can be resolved if we try to understand what was the controversy. *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, I am not allowing. *(Interruptions)*. There is no discussion on it. *(Interruptions)*. I am not allowing.

SHRI M. A. BABY: Let me complete one sentence. It is very simple. *(Interruptions)*. The hon. Minister made an observation regarding his colleagues in the Council of Ministers. He will not understand how his colleagues in the Council of Ministers function just by being a Member of this House. But as a member of the Council of Ministers he knows how his other colleagues have been functioning, whether they have been accepting bribes or not. Therefore, he can give an explanation only as a member of the Council of Ministers. This is our point.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is no point in it..*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA (Karnataka): Madam..*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have dealt with it and now you don't have to answer it. It is over..*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: Madam, this is in connection with Mr. Jain's explanation. Yesterday, because of a press report Mr. Bhardwaj had been asked to make a certain statement, a personal explanation, whatever it is. Can any individual Member come here and make a personal explanation? ..*(Interruptions)*... Under what circumstances is Mr. Jain making this personal explanation? What is it? Can any Member make personal explanation? ..*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jain, under what circumstances are you making this? ..*(Interruptions)*.. Let me find out..*(Interruptions)*..

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN (Maharashtra): Madam, the Chairman has already permitted him..*(Interruptions)*... Why are you cross-examining him? ..*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Members want to know. It is for information..*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI (Gujarat): You are questioning the decision of the Chair..*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Personal explanation is not private business..*(Interruptions)*... How can he be allowed to make a personal explanation..*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Chairman has permitted him and so I will permit him. He has given it in writing—what I was asking for yesterday. He has given it in writing. The Chairman has permitted him; so I am letting him make it..*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: Yesterday, his name was not taken. No allegation was made..*(Interruptions)*...

श्री विष्णु कान्त शास्त्री (उत्तर प्रदेश): माननीय भारद्वाज जी यहां हैं और उन्होंने कहा है...(व्यवधान) मुझे चाय पर बुलाकर मेरी जेब काटी गयी...(व्यवधान) यह सब इन्होंने कहा है...(व्यवधान)

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: His name was mentioned in the House. What sort of ..*(Interruptions)*...

श्री विष्णु कान्त शास्त्री: भारद्वाज जी यहां हैं ...(व्यवधान) भारद्वाज जी के प्रति मेरी श्रद्धा है...उन्होंने कहा कि मुझे चाय पिलाकर मेरी जेब काटी है ...(व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He says his name was mentioned..*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, I had..*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. Just a minute..*(Interruptions)*...शास्त्री जी, मेहरबानी करके आगर आप थोड़ी देर चुप बैठेंगे ना तो यह जो मसला है हल होने की कुछ उम्मीद नजर आती है।

श्री प्रमोद महाजन: मुझे अभी तक पता नहीं था कि यह मसला शास्त्री जी के कारण चल रहा है। मुझे तो लगा कि यह

भारद्वाज जी का मसला है...(व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : वह मसला भारद्वाज जी का है उसमें किसी से बात होगी तो साल्व हो जाएगा । आपका नाम किसने मेंशन किया था...(व्यवधान) एक मिनट ।

DR. JINENDRA KUMAR JAIN: Madam, under rule 141...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : नहीं नहीं, 141 में आपका नाम किसी ने लिया था । किसने लिया था ? मुझे सुनने दीजिए ...(व्यवधान) मुझे सुनने दीजिए । Please let me hear...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, I mentioned his name...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please let me hear him. There should be some courtesy when a Member is speaking and the Chair wants to hear him. This is a very bad habit. Members keep on interrupting and that is why all this confusion takes place. Please...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: It is a question of convention. He applied for permission and the Chairman permitted him. Now if the Chair starts asking him, "why are you making this statement"...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, I am not asking...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : Then let him make a personal explanation...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : आप भी न बोले तो बेहतर है ।

When I am in the Chair, I have to assert. The Chairman has given him permission with his full authority and knowing it very well. But if he is making a statement in this House, the Members have a right to know. Why do you object to it? The Members are asking ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : The Members have a right to know what ? You said there is no discussion on personal explanation and now you are allowing a discussion, I am sorry, but we are setting an absolutely wrong precedent. This is not a precedent of this House. This has never been the convention of the House. When the Chairman has permitted, the Member will get up and offer his explanation. That is the end of the matter. He cannot be interrogated like it is being done ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Again two people. Two people cannot speak together ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA : Madam, I want to say, I want to convey to you the information that yesterday while the discussion was going on, it was I who asked Mr. Bhardwaj whether it was taperecorded and videoed in the studio of Dr. Jain. He only confirmed. Therefore, it is I who raised it. I only wanted to convey this...*(Interruptions)*...

उपसभापति : लो. के. नाउ, बोले आप ।

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA : His name is not there in the records...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now that the Chairman has permitted, I will permit you ...*(Interruptions)* That is all about it ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI M. M. JACOB (Kerala) : The point is that Mr. Jain wants to make a statement against the allegation made by somebody, in this case, Mr. Bhardwaj. But if there was no allegation on record, why should he be allowed ? There was no allegation at all ...*(Interruptions)*

श्री विष्णु कान्त शास्त्री : उन्होंने कहा कि मुझको चाय पर बुला कर मेरी जेब काट ली ...(व्यवधान) माननीय उपसभापतिजी, आप उनसे पूछिये । उन्होंने कहा कि मुझको चाय पर बुला कर मेरी जेब काट ली । इससे ज्यादा और आरोप क्या हो सकता है । ...(व्यवधान) वह मेरे सामने बोले है, मैं यहां पर था । ...(व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now that the Chairman has given him permission, I will allow. That is all. We follow the rules ...*(Interruptions)* I Won't go beyond that ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu) : Madam, it should go on record that it is a very wrong precedent to be allowed to make a statement when no allegation was made ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : There was no allegation against Mr. Bhardwaj also. Why did he make a statement ? ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN : It was because you wanted it ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : Madam, we are setting a very wrong precedent by challenging in this House the decision of the Chairman. It is

very unfortunate that this should happen in this House. For the last 15 minutes, the Chairman's decision is being challenged ...*(Interruptions)* It is a very sad thing. I think you should direct Mr. Jain to make his statement immediately ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu) : It is very unfortunate that they are challenging the decision of the Chairman ...*(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mrs. Natarajan, I have not permitted you to come in the front ...*(Interruptions)* What is there for you to come in the front ? ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN : *

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Nothing will go on record ...*(Interruptions)* I would request your Minister to give you a front seat because you keep coming here ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN : *

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You please go back ...*(Interruptions)* I have asked you to go back...*(Interruptions)* Nothing will go on record ...*(Interruptions)* It is not going on record. I tell everybody in this House, whether it is Mr. Mathur or Mrs. Natarajan, to speak from their seats ...*(Interruptions)* If you are so willing, you ask Mr. Abrar Ahmed or Mrs. Margaret Alva to allow you. I won't permit you ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR (Uttar Pradesh) : I have not done anything. Why do you say my name ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Yesterday you were speaking from my seat ...*(Interruptions)* You spoke from my seat ...*(Interruptions)*

**वित्त मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री तथा संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (डा॰ अबरार अहमद)** : माननीय उपसभापति जी ...(व्यवधान)

DR. JINENDRA KUMAR JAIN : Shall I start ? ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN : An allegation is being made against us that we are challenging the Chairman's decision. It is rubbish. Nobody is challenging the Chairman's permission. All that we are saying is that.....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have heard what you are saying ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN : You don't want to hear me. What I am saying is.....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am only allowing what the chairman has allowed ...*(Interruptions)* I am not hearing anything ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN : We have got the greatest respect for the Chairman's decision ...*(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have identified him ...*(Interruptions)*

**डा॰ अबरार अहमद** : बोलिये । ...(व्यवधान)

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN : Madam, he is yielding. What is your problem, Madam ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mrs. Natarajan, don't get agitated. Mr. Ahmed, what do you want to say ?

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN : I protest ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : What are you asking the Minister to say ? Why ? The Chairman has given the permission. Ask Mr. Jain to speak...*(Interruptions)* It is very unfortunate that sitting in that Chair, you are permitting the Chairman's decision to be challenged in this House by a Member ...*(Interruptions)* It is a very shameful thing ...*(Interruptions)* We can't be a party to that, Madam. It is very unfortunate that you are being a party to the challenging of the decision of the Chairman.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Abrar Ahmed is not challenging it. I have permitted Dr. Jain as the Chairman has permitted him. Mr. Ahmed is the Parliamentary Affairs Minister. He is not challenging the Chairman's permission. He wants to add something. Why do you object to it ? Whatever he wants to say, let him say.

**डा॰ अबरार अहमद** : माननीय उपसभापतिजी, सभापतिजी ने जो अनुमति दी है, जो परमिशन दी है, हम उसका पूरा सम्मान करते है और जैसा माननीय सिन्हा साहब कह रहे हैं, हम उनकी अनुमति को किसी प्रकार का कुछ चैलेंज नहीं कर रहे हैं, लेकिन एक बात जो यहां सामने आई है कि जो डा॰ जिनेन्द्र कुमार जैन ने सभापति जी से परमिशन ...(व्यवधान)

I am not challenging the permission of the Chairman.

* Not recorded.

श्री कैलाश नारायण सारंग (मध्य प्रदेश) : चेयरमैन की अथारिटी को चैलेंज करने का आपको क्या अधिकार है। ...(व्यवधान) चैलेंज करने का आपको क्या अधिकार है।...(व्यवधान)

डा. अबरार अहमद : अजीब बात है।

I am not challenging the decision of the Chairman. We are ready to honour the permission given by the Chairman.

श्री कैलाश नारायण सारंग : जज की अथारिटी को चैलेंज कर रहे हैं और यह षड्यंत्र नहीं है तो क्या है।...(व्यवधान) आप बोलने नहीं देना चाहते आप बोलने दीजिए। आप बैठिए।...(व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : बोलिए, प्रि० जैन, बोलिए। ...(व्यवधान)

Please speak briefly.

डा. अबरार अहमद : महोदया, मैं यह कह रहा था कि माननीय अध्यक्ष महोदय ने जो अनुमति दी है हम पूरी तरह से उसका सम्मान करते हैं, आदर करते हैं। लेकिन एक बात ...(व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : लेकिन कुछ नहीं, आप बैठ जाइये। ...(व्यवधान)... लेकिन नहीं, चेयरमैन ने परमिशन दी है। ...(व्यवधान)

डा. अबरार अहमद : आप मेरी बात तो सुनें। ...(व्यवधान)

श्री कैलाश नारायण सारंग : आप यह बताइये जब अध्यक्ष महोदय ने परमिशन दी है...(व्यवधान) मेरी बात सुनिए। जब अध्यक्ष महोदय ने परमिशन दी तो कुछ ...(व्यवधान) उनका एक्शन ...(व्यवधान)... फिर आपको क्या अधिकार है। ...(व्यवधान)

SHRI S. MUTHU MANI (Tamil Nadu) : What is this, Madam? He is challenging the decision of the Chairman. It is very unfortunate.

डा. अबरार अहमद : महोदया...(व्यवधान) जो लिख कर दिया ...(व्यवधान) अनुमति मांगी ...(व्यवधान) क्या परिस्थिति है, क्या फैक्चुअल पोज़ीशन उनके सामने रखी? ...(व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Abrar Ahmed, I don't ever question the wisdom of the Chairman. If he has given permission, I am going to ask him to speak. There is no point in it. When he gave the permission, that is all.

## PERSONAL EXPLANATION BY DR. JINENDRA KUMAR JAIN

DR. JINENDRA KUMAR JAIN (Madhya Pradesh) : Madam, I thank you very much for giving me permission to speak... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not allowing, please sit down... *(Interruptions)*... I am not allowing.

SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA (Assam) : There is some allegation by Mr. Yashwant Sinha. Somebody might have spoken something... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please, there is no need... *(Interruptions)*... Dr. Jain.

DR. JINENDRA KUMAR JAIN : Madam, I thank you very much for giving me this opportunity to provide personal explanation to this hon. House regarding what the hon. Minister for Law and Justice, Shri H. R. Bhardwaj, spoke yesterday. I believe, Madam, that all the hon. Members of this House including those who are trying to object to my giving personal explanation must have read today's newspapers. It is widely reported by the Press in all prominent editions today as to what had transpired yesterday, both what Mr. Bhardwaj submitted to this House and what the hon. Prime Minister said in the Lok Sabha.

Madam, the issue is video-recording of Mr. Bhardwaj's interview. It was recorded by a very eminent journalist in India, Mr. Pritish Nandy. It was done for Doordarshan. There is a programme known as "Pritish Nandy Show". This journalist must have contacted this hon. Minister. He has a right to communicate and it was in exercise of this right that he recorded a programme for Doordarshan. What Mr. Bhardwaj said yesterday was that he went to the residence of Dr. Jain who is a Member of this House. He put it in a very poetic manner. He said "What do you do if somebody calls you for dinner and picks your pocket?"

Madam, two wrong impressions have gone out of this : one, as if some impropriety was done by me in conducting this video-recording and, second, as if some manipulation, alteration, distortion, was done to the statement which Shri Bhardwaj made in this video-recording.

Regarding my personal explanation, let me make it very clear to this House, to the hon.